

Application Number	18/0119/FUL	Agenda Item	
Date Received	23rd January 2018	Officer	Eloise Limmer
Target Date	20th March 2018		
Ward	East Chesterton		
Site	Pavilion Chesterton Recreation Ground Church Street Cambridge		
Proposal	Single storey extension to existing pavilion with external terrace.		
Applicant	Mr Ian Ross Hobson House 44 St Andrews Street Cambridge CB2 3AS		

SUMMARY	<p>The development accords with the Development Plan for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed extension to the pavilion would preserve the character of the conservation area. • The proposed extension to the pavilion would not have a significant adverse impact on the amenity of neighbouring occupiers. • The proposed extension to the pavilion is acceptable in terms of design.
RECOMMENDATION	APPROVAL

1.0 SITE DESCRIPTION/AREA CONTEXT

1.1 The application site is the sports pavilion situated on the eastern side of Chesterton recreation ground close to the pedestrian entrance into the recreation ground from Church Street. To the east of the site is a single storey public WC block and recycling facility. To the north are four recently constructed three storey residential dwellings (7-10 Church Street). To the west is a fenced children’s play area and skateboard ramp. To the south is the Grade I listed Parish Church of St Andrew that

sits within its Grade II listed churchyard. The recreation ground is a protected open space within the city and recorded on the Council's adopted Playing Pitch Strategy (2016). The site falls within Chesterton conservation area.

2.0 THE PROPOSAL

- 2.1 The application seeks full planning permission for a single storey extension to the existing pavilion with an external terrace. The existing building is 47m²; the new extension would provide 86m² of additional accommodation as well as 18m² of additional external covered storage. The proposed extension to the Pavilion would be mainly situated on the south-western end of the existing; overlooking the main sports facilities. The proposed facilities would include a new multi-purpose club room, an enlarged kitchen and internal and external storage facilities.
- 2.2 The extension would wrap around the existing building which currently measures 12m x 4.5m. The kitchen would project out 3.5m to the south-east and the external store would project out 3.5m to the north-west; both in line with the existing building. The club room would then extend 6.4m to the south-west and would be 10m in width. The internal store would extend from the club room projecting 2.5m to the northwest. New fencing would surround the site; the secure external covered storage area to the north-west of the existing building would be accessed via a gate between the Pavilion and the public WC.
- 2.3 A raised terrace to the south is also proposed; this would provide both stepped and ramped access to the building. It would be partially covered, mainly along the south-eastern elevation, by a flat roof supported by timber columns. It would provide outdoor seating to the south, projecting a further 4m from the extended pavilion. The edge of the terrace would go past the existing play area fence line; it is proposed that the play area fence line nearest the pavilion would be removed and finished to the edge of the new balcony. This would help to integrate the extended pavilion into the Recreation Ground.

2.4 The scheme has been amended to address officer concerns about the impact on the neighbouring properties. The following changes were made:

- New extension has been moved away from boundary fence to allow a 1m gap for maintenance and help reduce overlooking.
- Boiler vent and extract shown on North West elevation has been removed; the heating will be electric not gas and will therefore not require the vent and extract.
- End of external terrace has been moved further away from neighbouring properties and brought in line with the edge of the canopy over the club room doors to help address overlooking concerns.
- Main playground gates have been added to the Existing Site Plan for clarity.
- External terrace layout and access adjacent to the main playground gates has been simplified.
- Main playground gates have been moved out to line up with external terrace to improve access from the main path.
- Visible facades of existing changing room block will be overclad to match the new extension in order to create a more cohesive look.

2.5 Planning permission 14/0790/FUL for the development of Cambridge City Football Ground has a S106 developer contribution and condition for formal outdoor sports with funds allocated for the development of Chesterton Recreation Ground. This planning application has been worked up in consultation with local groups and representatives, the funds have been received by the City Council and now await the development and approval of an appropriate project for the funds to be released.

2.6 This application is being decided by Committee because the application involves the City Council as applicant and landowner and the development is not of a minor nature.

3.0 SITE HISTORY

Reference	Description	Outcome
C/82/0870	Erection of changing room	Approved
C/00/0129	Alterations and single storey extensions to existing changing pavilion to provide additional changing rooms, shower rooms and kitchen facilities	Approved subject to conditions

4.0 PUBLICITY

4.1	Advertisement:	Yes
	Adjoining Owners:	Yes
	Site Notice Displayed:	Yes

5.0 POLICY

5.1 See Appendix 1 for full details of Central Government Guidance, Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies, Supplementary Planning Documents and Material Considerations.

5.2 Relevant Development Plan policies

PLAN		POLICY NUMBER
Cambridge Plan 2006	Local	3/1 3/4 3/7 3/11 3/14 4/2 4/11 6/2 8/6

5.3 Relevant Central Government Guidance, Supplementary Planning Documents and Material Considerations

Central Government Guidance	National Planning Policy Framework March 2012
-----------------------------	---

	National Planning Policy Framework – Planning Practice Guidance March 2014 Circular 11/95 (Annex A)
Supplementary Planning Guidance	Sustainable Design and Construction (May 2007) Planning Obligation Strategy (March 2010)
Material Considerations	<u>City Wide Guidance</u> Cambridge City Council (2011) - Open Space and Recreation Strategy A Major Sports Facilities Strategy for the Cambridge Sub-Region (2006)
	<u>Area Guidelines</u> Chesterton and Ferry Lane Conservation Area Appraisal (2009)

5.4 Status of Proposed Submission – Cambridge Local Plan

Planning applications should be determined in accordance with policies in the adopted Development Plan and advice set out in the NPPF. However, after consideration of adopted plans and the NPPF, policies in emerging plans can also be given some weight when determining applications. For Cambridge, therefore, the emerging revised Local Plan as published for consultation on 19 July 2013 can be taken into account, especially those policies where there are no or limited objections to it. However it is likely, in the vast majority of instances, that the adopted development plan and the NPPF will have considerably more weight than emerging policies in the revised Local Plan.

For the application considered in this report, there are no policies in the emerging Local Plan that should be taken into account.

6.0 CONSULTATIONS

Cambridgeshire County Council (Highways Development Management)

- 6.1 The Highway Authority does not consider that this application will have any significant adverse impact upon the operation of the Highway Network

Urban Design and Conservation Team

- 6.2 The development proposed is acceptable subject to conditions. The existing single storey pavilion is of no particular architectural or historic interest and it is unfortunate that the applicant is not proposing to take the opportunity to demolish it and to start from scratch. Having said that, provided the materials and details are appropriate, the proposed extension is not considered to be harmful to the character or appearance of the conservation area and will not affect the setting of any of the listed buildings in the area.
- 6.3 The proposed cladding material is not traditionally found in the conservation area and there are concerns that they may not weather well in this highly visible location. The Conservation Team would encourage the applicant to consider natural materials rather than man-made for this prominent location and samples should be provided on site to ensure that any proposed cladding will work with the existing building.

Access Officer

- 6.4 Double doors will need to be asymmetrical with one leaf being at least 900mm and having an opening force of less than 20N.
- 6.5 The above responses are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the consultation responses can be inspected on the application file.

7.0 REPRESENTATIONS

- 7.1 The owners/occupiers of the following addresses have made representations:
- Objection:
- 7 Church Street

- 10 Church Street
- Turnwood (Church Street) Ltd

Support:

- 149 Coleridge Road
- 16 Eachard Road
- 2 Grayling Close
- 7 Guest Road
- 13 Hertford Street
- 16 Jermyn Close
- 67 Kendal Way
- 8 Kinross Road
- 1 Lanthorn Stile, Fulbourn
- 25 Magrath Avenue
- 51 Oxford Road
- 96 Scotland Road
- 10 Silverwood Close
- 6 Upper Gwydir Street
- 58 Windsor Road (Chair of Chesterton Eagles)x2

7.2 The representations can be summarised as follows:

Objections

7.3 *Scope:*

- The scope should be extended to include the public toilets and recycling area, this scheme is missing an opportunity to deliver full value to the community. S106 funds from the development of 7-10 Church Street could be used.
- The purpose of the proposed plans/building is to increase social and family activities in and around the buildings. This will lead to an increase in noise/disturbance and also to increase usage of the associated public toilets and recycling area both of which are in a very sorry state.

7.4 *Privacy:*

- There are direct sight lines into the gardens and lower ground floor kitchens of the 7-10 Church Street. The terrace is between 600mm and 800mm higher than existing ground

level and reduces the screening level of the existing fences so that unobstructed views are provided.

7.5 *Overshadowing:*

- The roof structure will have a significant negative visual impact and light shadow on some or all of 7-10 Church Street. The proposed building would be much higher than the existing pavilion and the ridge is close to 10 Church Street. The shadow study shows a significant effect on the morning light in 10 Church Street's garden from September to March.

7.6 *Overbearing:*

- The new substantial rear addition will appear extremely dominant and bulky on site and will extend along the entirety of the eastern boundary of the Church Street houses. The height is approximately 1.1m higher than the existing pavilion. It will disrupt the pleasant and open outlook currently enjoyed by residents. The existing pavilion is nestled within the trees and hidden from view.

7.7 *Boundary maintenance:*

- We would require an undertaking that a) nothing would be stored against our boundary fence, b) any damage to our boundary fence either during construction or afterwards be immediately repaired and made good by the applicant at their cost c) we are given a key to the new fence and gate shown between the changing rooms and public toilets to allow us to access and maintain our boundary fence.

7.8 *Materials/design:*

- Marley Eternit Cedral cladding has a very unpleasant textured plastic finish and the red roof tiles, while similar to the existing pavilion are also a poor choice and do nothing to enhance the conservation area. The materials do not borrow from or sympathise with any of their neighbours and do not reflect the generally excellent quality of materials around them. Higher quality materials would be more appropriate; timber cladding or red brick for walls and cedar shingles, clay tiles, or slate for the roof.

7.9 *Noise/smells:*

- The new pavilion shows a grille on the north-west elevation, depending on what this is used for it could disturb 7-10 Church Street and at the very least provides an ongoing maintenance issue.

7.10 *'Dead zone':*

- Currently most pedestrians and dog walkers walk around through the gap between the playground and the pavilion however with the playground fixing directly onto the pavilion and a raised terrace which will deter transit the path will change to create a dead zone.

7.11 *Information/Consultation:*

- Despite the proposed new pavilion having an impact on 7-10 Church Street as well as potentially the Dovecote only 10 Church Street was consulted.
- We feel that this application should be described as a new pavilion as the building will deliver an additional 104m² which is more than double the size of the existing changing block (47m²). This is a significant increase which cannot be described as subsidiary to the existing changing room block.

7.12 *Trees:*

- Certain trees within this conservation area were discussed in the application as being protected during/after construction, a number of existing trees immediately to the rear of our property received no specific mention. It should be a condition of any approval that all existing trees, some recently pruned back, receive equal protection.

7.13 Support

- A large number of the parents and supporters of Chesterton Eagles FC have responded in support this application. Chesterton Eagles is one of the only clubs in the region without a proper 'club house' facility and this is a long overdue and exciting development for the club and the local community.
- They consider that there will be no adverse effects on the surrounding area. The existing facilities are not suitable for

the needs of local people, there needs to be proper facilities for everyone. The extended building will become an asset to more local groups and activities.

- This is a modern but aesthetically tasteful improvement to the outdated and utilitarian existing building. The current building is so small little can be operated out of it, the kitchen facilities are poor and there is no proper storage.
- The terrace area would solve the ongoing issue of dog fouling in the space between the current building and play area which will be an improvement for the families and children that play around there.
- Cambridge has suffered huge growth in house building and it is high time that some of the S106 money given to the Council was invested into local improvements. This will encourage exercise and provide a good local facility for families and groups to use.

7.14 The above representations are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the representations can be inspected on the application file.

8.0 ASSESSMENT

8.1 From the consultation responses and representations received and from my inspection of the site and the surroundings, I consider that the main issues are:

1. Principle of development
2. Context of site, design and external spaces (and impact on heritage assets)
3. Disabled access
4. Residential amenity
5. Car and cycle parking
6. Third party representations

Principle of Development

8.2 This development is an extension of the existing facilities therefore Policy 3/14 (Extending Buildings) of the Cambridge Local Plan (2006) is pertinent. This states that the extension of existing buildings will be permitted if they:

- a. reflect or successfully contrast with their form, use of materials and architectural detailing;

- b. do not unreasonably overlook, overshadow or visually dominate neighbouring properties;
- c. retain sufficient amenity space, bin storage, vehicular access and car and cycle parking; and
- d. do not adversely affect listed buildings or their settings, the character or appearance of conservation areas, gardens of local interest, trees or important wildlife features.

It is considered that this application meets these criteria; the detail of this will be addressed throughout this report.

8.3 This development also represents an improvement of a leisure facility which is covered by Policy 6/2 (New Leisure Facilities) of the Cambridge Local Plan (2006). This states that development for the provision or improvement of a leisure facility will be permitted if:

- a. it improves the range, quality and accessibility of facilities;
- b. it is of an appropriate scale for the locality; and
- c. it would not have a negative impact upon the vitality and viability of the City Centre, including the evening economy.

It is considered that this application meets these criteria; the detail of this will be addressed throughout this report.

8.4 In my opinion, the principle of the development is acceptable and in accordance with policies 3/14 and 6/2 of the Cambridge Local Plan (2006)

Context of site, design and external spaces (and impact on heritage assets)

8.5 The existing Chesterton Recreation Ground Pavilion is a single storey detached brick structure providing two team changing rooms, referee's room, toilets, showers and a small kitchenette. It is situated adjacent to the single storey public WC and recycling facility close to the vehicle access gates and pedestrian access on Church Street. The recreation ground is a protected open space and is used for formal and informal sporting activities as well as local community events.

8.6 Access to the pavilion and public WCs is from a pedestrian entrance into the recreation ground off Church Street, along a carrstone footpath with heavy duty buff paving outside the entrances providing level access to both facilities. Car parking is all offsite and provided for by on street parking on Church Street

directly outside the recreation ground entrance in free short stay parking bays.

- 8.7 The proposal includes improvements to the landscaping in the vicinity. An amended and widened footpath will run alongside the extended pavilion. There will be ramped access to the buildings main entrance which will link with the new terrace allowing disabled access. New cycle storage would be provided to the south-east of the retained section of the pavilion building. The new kitchen is situated on the side of the building which allows service of both the indoor space and the external terrace via hatches.
- 8.8 The proposal includes increased provision of internal and external stores. There will be also be an external covered storage area for larger pieces of equipment. This area will be situated to the west of the retained pavilion. A new fenced area will also be introduced as part of this scheme; this would block the existing narrow passage between the boundary fence of 10 Church Street and the existing pavilion and WC buildings. The fence at the end of the rear gardens of 7-10 Church Street will be extended across to meet the side wall of the Pavilion to enclose this space. A gate would be placed between the WC and pavilion buildings; this ensures that the external covered store is secure.
- 8.9 There is a children's play area adjacent to the site. The existing play area fence line nearest to the Pavilion would be removed and finished to the edge of the new raised terrace. This is proposed to open the play area up more and integrate the extended pavilion into the recreation ground. It would also design out a small strip of grass that would otherwise be difficult to maintain.
- 8.10 The proposed pitched roof of the extension is higher than the existing block. It is an asymmetrical pitched roof design that provides maximum ceiling height over the key space, the multi-purpose club room, and then drops down over the more utilitarian rooms. This shape also adds some interest to the design and creates a more contemporary look.
- 8.11 The extension cannot be said to be subservient to the existing building as it is significantly larger and actually engulfs the southern end of the current pavilion. However, there is

restricted funding for improvements at this site and the retention of the existing building as part of the scheme is a sustainable solution.

8.12 The roof tiles are proposed to be red concrete tiles to match the existing. The existing brick structure and the extension would be clad in fibre cement weather boards. At this stage the applicant is proposing these to be black or dark grey in colour to ensure the appearance can be maintained as dark colours are less affected by graffiti and other markings. The Conservation Officer has suggested that natural materials should be considered as they are concerned that the suggested material might not weather well in this highly visible location. A condition is recommended seeking samples of the facing materials on site, and the final materials to be agreed with the Local Planning Authority before works are started. I am confident that materials that suit the requirements of the applicant while still preserving the character of the conservation area can be agreed. Subject to agreeing materials the proposed extension is not considered to be harmful to the character or appearance of the conservation area and will not affect the setting of any of the listed buildings in the area.

8.13 In my opinion the proposal is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 3/4, 3/7, 3/11, 3/14, 4/11.

Disabled access

8.14 The ground level dips towards the south of the site. To ensure level access throughout the building a raised terrace has been proposed to the south and east of the site to compensate for the change of level on the exterior. There will be a ramp to allow disabled access to the terrace and pavilion building. The Access Officer has advised that the double doors will need to be asymmetrical with one leaf being at least 900mm and having an opening force of less than 20N.

8.15 In my opinion the proposal is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 3/7 and 3/12.

Residential Amenity

Impact on amenity of neighbouring occupiers

10 Church Street

- 8.16 There are no windows on the elevation facing 10 Church Street therefore there will be no increase in overlooking from inside the building. The occupier was concerned about views from the raised terrace into their rear garden and ground and first floor rear rooms. I consider that the amended scheme which has moved the terrace towards the south of the site has mitigated this impact so the level of overlooking is now acceptable. The pavilion building itself will block most of the views from the terrace and any more oblique views are over long distances.
- 8.17 The application site is to the south east of 10 Church Street and there is concern from neighbours about the negative visual impact and light shadow on 7-10 Church Street. A shadow study was submitted as part of the application to show the impact on the neighbours' amenity space. It is claimed that the shadow study shows 'a significant effect on the morning light in 10 Church Street's garden from September to March'. However, 10 Church Street has a tall fence surrounding the garden which casts a significant shadow and it is considered that the increase in overshadowing compared to this existing situation is at an acceptable level. The limited impact is also only seen in the morning light in spring and autumn. It is not the whole period of March to September that is affected as the summer (June) morning light is unaffected.
- 8.18 In terms of overbearing, it is recognised that the extended pavilion is closer to the boundary and 1m higher at the ridge than the existing. However the eaves height closest to this boundary is 2.5m at most and the ridge is situated 6m from the boundary. This property has a very open outlook to the rear and it is not considered that the overbearing effect of the proposal would cause an unacceptable impact on the amenity of the occupiers.
- 8.19 The amended scheme has moved the building line away from the boundary with 10 Church Street to allow access for maintenance of the boundary fence. The space between the boundary fence and the pavilion is proposed to be closed off by

fencing as part of this application. The details regarding the use of the space, including leaning equipment against the fence, and access for maintenance for the occupiers of No.10 are not material planning considerations and should be discussed directly with the applicant.

8.20 The other properties in the new development (7-10 Church Street) are considered to be a significant distance from the application site and therefore the amenity of the occupiers will not be affected by this proposal.

8.21 In my opinion the proposal adequately respects the residential amenity of its neighbours and the constraints of the site and I consider that it is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 3/4 and 3/7.

Bin storage

8.22 No details of bin provision or storage have been provided and it is anticipated that the larger facility will require more bin provision than the existing situation. I am confident that the site can accommodate adequate provision but a condition is recommended to secure the details before the development commences.

Car and Cycle Parking

8.23 The existing car parking situation will be maintained, i.e. on-street parking on Church Street. The minimum provision set out in the Council's cycle parking guidance is 1 space for every 25 m² net floor area. This scheme has a floor area of 133m² which would require 6 cycle parking spaces; 8 cycle parking spaces are provided. A condition is recommended to secure this.

8.24 In my opinion the proposal is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 8/6 and 8/10.

Third Party Representations

8.25 Several comments suggested that the scope of this scheme should be extended to include the adjacent public toilets and recycling area. However this project is constrained by the money available from the S106 agreement which is not enough to increase the scope in this way. The funds from 7-10 Church

Street's S106 Agreement have not been allocated to this scheme.

- 8.26 Comments regarding the material choice have been noted; the materials are recommended to be conditioned which will allow the Conservation Officer to see samples of the proposed materials in context on site before they are agreed. The final material choices will have to be agreed with the Local Planning Authority; this will ensure that the materials will preserve the character of the conservation area.
- 8.27 A condition is recommended to require a tree protection plan to be submitted before development commences; this will ensure that any trees potentially affected by the construction works are protected.
- 8.28 It was highlighted by some respondents that the initial neighbour consultation was not wide enough; this was remedied during the re-consultation in which all the residents of the 7-10 Church Street development were notified.

9.0 CONCLUSION

- 9.1 The proposed extension to the pavilion would not have a significant adverse impact on the amenity of the neighbouring occupiers. It is considered to be of appropriate scale and design and would preserve the character of the conservation area. It would provide improved facilities for the football club and would be a beneficial space for the wider community.

10.0 RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: In accordance with the requirements of section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans as listed on this decision notice.

Reason: In the interests of good planning, for the avoidance of doubt and to facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

3. Details of the specification and position of fencing, or any other measures to be taken for the protection of any trees from damage during the course of development, shall be submitted to the local planning authority for its written approval, and implemented in accordance with that approval before any equipment, machinery or materials are brought onto the site for the purpose of development (including demolition). The agreed means of protection shall be retained on site until all equipment, and surplus materials have been removed from the site. Nothing shall be stored or placed in any area protected in accordance with this condition, and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered nor shall any excavation be made without the prior written approval of the local planning authority.

Reason: To protect the visual amenity of the area and to ensure the retention of the trees on the site. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/4, 3/11, 3/12 and 4/4)

4. Before starting works, a sample of the facing materials to be used shall be provided on site to establish the visual relationship with the existing building. These materials shall be agreed in writing with the local planning authority. The quality of finish and materials incorporated in any approved sample panel(s) shall be maintained throughout the development.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenity of the Conservation Area. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/12 and 4/11)

5. No construction work or demolition work shall be carried out or plant operated other than between the following hours: 0800 hours and 1800 hours on Monday to Friday, 0800 hours and 1300 hours on Saturday and at no time on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of the adjoining properties. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/13)

6. No development shall commence until details of facilities for the covered, secured parking of bicycles for use in connection with the development hereby permitted shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority in writing. The approved facilities shall be provided in accordance with the approved details before use of the development commences.

Reason: To ensure appropriate provision for the secure storage of bicycles. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 8/6)

7. Prior to the commencement of development, full details of the on-site storage facilities for waste, including waste for recycling shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Such details shall identify the specific positions of where wheeled bins, or any other means of storage will be stationed and the specific arrangements to enable collection from within 10m of the kerbside of the adopted highway/ refuse collection vehicle access point. The approved facilities shall be provided prior to the commencement of the use hereby permitted and shall be retained thereafter.

Reason: To protect the amenities of nearby residents/occupiers and in the interests of visual amenity. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/12 and 4/13)